

APPROVED

VILLAGE OF CHESTNUT RIDGE

PLANNING BOARD MINUTES

MAY 4, 2017

MEMBERS PRESENT:

ALLAN RUBIN	CHAIRMAN
MARC LEVINE	DEPUTY CHAIRMAN
ANTONIO LUCIANO	MEMBER
JEFF WASSERMAN	MEMBER

OTHERS PRESENT:

PAUL BAUM	ASSISTANT VILLAGE ATTORNEY
MAX STACH	VILLAGE PLANNER
DENNIS ROCKS	VILLAGE ENGINEER
MARY BALLEK	PLANNING BOARD CLERK

NOT PRESENT: MYRNA ARIN, MEMBER

Chairman Rubin called the meeting to order 8 pm with the Pledge of Allegiance.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

Chairman Rubin asked Ms. Ballek to read into the record any documentation that was received since the applicant was last before the board. The following was read into the record:

Letter from Hakim Associates dates April 3, 2009.

Letter from Mr. Grogg dated April 17, 2009.

Letter from Blair Hines/Wasser Associates dated April 20, 2009.

Letter from Blair Hines/Wasser Associates dated May 7, 2009 with and without markup.

revised Landscaping plans as per the April 30, 2017 on-site visit; L1, L2, L3 and L4. All received May 1, 2017.

Mr. Rocks' review memo dated April 5, 2017.

Mr. Stach's review memo dated April 10, 2017 re: Wetland Mitigation and April 12, 2017.

Letter from RC Planning dated April 10, 2017.

Letter from RC Sewer District #1 dated March 1, 2017.

Mr. Grogg wanted to review 2 items:

1. There are 2 lots on this property; 1 is an existing Manse which is off of Lynn Drive. The Manse is under the ownership of the Coptic Church Diocese and the larger property is under the ownership of the Virgin Mary Church. It's the intent to keep this way until the project is given Subdivision approval. Under direction of the Village, the Manse will be considered as the primary use and not the accessory use. The Front yard setback Front yard setback is 100 feet and the side yard set back is 75 feet.
2. Will remain as 2 different owners until Subdivision approval is given, at which time the ownership will transfer to the Virgin Mary.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

Mr. Pfaff stated that he's working on the floor plans for the inside of the property. The building has increased in height to accommodate the dome structure. There will also be 12 windows circled around the dome. The top of the dome has been moved 5 feet above what was previously approved.

Chairman Rubin voiced the following comments:

1. The landscaping plans show the same date as what was originally submitted. Asked that the new date be shown with revised plans.
2. Requested color photographs of the trees and shrubs; 10 sets total for the Board and consultants.
3. From the April 30th site visit: Wants to make sure it's structurally sound and can take the weight of a fire truck.
4. A member of the Church who is a structural engineer sent structural drawings to be reviewed.
5. Has the traffic study been reviewed by John Sarna? Mr. Stach will follow up regarding comments.

Mr. Rocks stated that the application must decide if the dam repairs are going to be part of this application.

Mr. Rocks had some questions regarding the drainage. He noted changes to the Storm Water regulations since the original approval. Most notably the rainfall depths have increased. The applicants engineer will reply to Mr. Rocks and the issue will be resolved.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

There was a discussion on busing;

Mr. Grogg said the buses don't operate on Sundays. The actual driveways and buses will be counted as per Mr. Grogg. Chairman Rubin asked which entrance and exit would be used?

Chairman Rubin asked the Board if any previous comments, either CDRC or respective consultant review memos have been addressed. Mr. Stach spoke with the applicant's landscape architect and discussed his preliminary comments. Most of Mr. Stach's concerns spoke about how the planting plan ages; some of the buffers would grow fast and large. The landscaping will look good when 1st installed but as time goes on there will need to be some maintenance. Mr. Stach said he and the landscape architect agreed to have a note put on the plans that would state the need for maintenance as well as removal of trees if they become too large.

Mr. Grogg said a note will be added to the plans that will reflect use for religious education and not for general education. The nursery school will go through New York State regarding the regulations on sq. footage, and the size of classroom.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

Chairman Rubin opened the meeting to the public.

1. Bruce Goldsmith, 2 Weiss Terrace, Chestnut Ridge, NY 10977

Asked if a traffic study had already been done? Chairman Rubin said the applicant had a traffic study prepared and submitted to the Board. Mr. Stach said the traffic engineer called him to see if any other projects were going on in the Village and Artis Senior Living was mentioned.

2. Claudia Gollub, 2 Sunny Ridge Court, Chestnut Ridge, NY 10977

a. Asked the hours of the Nursery school and Sunday school. Mr. Pfaff said the nursery school would be open Monday to Friday 6:00 am to 6:00 pm, while Sunday school would be Sunday only -maybe an hour or 2 after church.

There may also be some evening church meetings as well. Approximately 70 children with parent drop off time will create extra traffic.

Mr. Grogg stated that part of the supplemental study that was performed, the traffic engineer will include the larger number.

b. Asked how many families are in the Coptic community? Mr. Pfaff stated there would be seating for 800 people between the main floor level and the mezzanine.

Mr. Grogg will provide will provide a Schedule of Activities.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

Mr. Levine asked if there would be cooking on the premises. Mr. Grogg said that on the lower level of the revised plans is a social area that was reconfigured to show a kitchen among other conveniences.

Mr. Rocks wants the applicant to appear at the CDRC once the plans have been updated. They will also need to appear before the Zoning Board before the Planning Board grants Preliminary approval.

The Building Inspector is to determine the Manse issue and the applicant can modify the plans so the bulk table is correct.

Mr. Rocks suggested reconfirming the variances since they are tied to SEQRA. Mr. Stach stated that at the time the Board rendered the Negative Declaration they required balloons to be floated and a visual impact report to be submitted that was based on the prior height.

Discussion on the proposed 2.1-foot increase of the dome. Mr Phaff stated that the original elevation to the top of the dome was 5.04 feet. Mr Stach explained that it would be up to the Board to determine if this increase would be considered a significant impact that would require additional balloon testing.

Mr. Grogg stated the structure is 509 feet from the foundation to the top of the dome. The grade at the road is 428-430.

Mr. Baum referenced the prior Negative Declaration that the Board rendered in 2008-2009, and stated that once a negative declaration has been rendered; it remains in effect until the Board either rescinds or rejects it.

Mr. Levine asked if the height to the front view has changed, Mr. Pfaff explained it hasn't; it's the same height as what was granted by variance in 2009. Mr Levine asked how the dome height was going to affect the housing complex on the other side of the parking lot on Chestnut Ridge Road. Mr. Stach referenced the original balloon test report that shows the dome from various locations. Looking at these photos would be able to decide what the impact of 5 feet would be.

Coptic Church—Public Hearing for Preliminary Site Plan Approval

Applicant is seeking approval for several minor changes some of which include elimination of the Bell Tower near the entrance, revisions to the roof projectile and an addition of a Nursery School.

Tax Designation 63.09-1-59, 60, Zone R-40.

Steven Grogg, P.E., McLaren Engineering, 100 Snake Hill Road, West Nyack NY 10994

Terry Rice, Rice and Amon, 4 Executive Blvd-Suite 100, Suffern, NY 10901

William Pfaff AIA, LEED AP, 208 Foss Drive, Upper Nyack, NY 10960

It was decided that Blair Hines the architect on this project would reply to Mr. Stach's letter dated April 12, 2017 to address concerns that Mr. Levine mentioned regarding replacing trees every 2-3 year. Mr. Levine requested the applicant come up with a plan for plantings that will work now as well as in the future and if new trees needed to be changed then that's what should happen.

Chairman Rubin made a motion to adjourn the Coptic Church Preliminary Site Plan Application to the July 6, 2017 Planning Board meeting. Mr. Luciano seconded the motion. All those in favor, upon vote, the motion carried. The applicant will appear at the June 13, 2017 CDRC meeting as well as the June 25, 2017 Zoning Board meeting to request the variances they require.

Banker Estates—Continuation of Public Hearing Final Subdivision Applicant is seeking approval for the construction, maintenance and use of two family dwellings on Lots 2 and 3. The Property is located on the East side of Banker Street, 0 Feet South of Old Nyack Turnpike.

Tax Designation 57.17-2-11, Zone R-15.

Amy Mele, attorney for applicant, 4 Laurel Road New City NY 10956

Rachel Barese, Civil Tec Engineering & Surveying PC, 139 Lafayette Avenue, Suffern, NY 10901

Ms. Mele began with a discussion on the Notice of Intent documents that were sent to the following agencies:

Town of Ramapo, DPW

Rockland County Sewer District #1

Rockland County Highway Department

Rockland County Health Department-Mosquito Control

Chestnut Ridge Village Zoning Board of Appeals

Replies from all except Town of Ramapo DPW, Rockland County Highway Department and Chestnut Ridge Village Zoning Board of Appeals.

Ms. Mele explained that the applicant was scheduled to appear at the April CDRC meeting but didn't appear due to the Passover holiday. She's in receipt of the consultant's review memos; most recently Mr. Rock's review memo of this past week.

Ms. Mele requested the application be continued to the June Planning Board meeting. Outstanding comments to be addressed and forwarded to Mr. Rocks in time to review for the June meeting.

Ms. Barese stated that she will resubmit plans addressing the consultant's concerns by May 8, 2017 and will submit directly to the consultants.

Chairman Rubin opened the meeting to the public.

1. Hilda Kogut, 20 Pine Knoll Court, Chestnut Ridge, NY 10977

- a. Asked if this was a 2-family house or 2 separate family dwellings. Mr. Baum explained they were 2 2 family dwellings.
- b. Are these single family attached town houses in this complex? Concerned that 2 family homes will be built in the Village where there have only been 1 family homes previously. Mr. Baum stated that 2 family uses are permitted in the Village.

Chairman Rubin asked if anyone else wished to speak. No one did.

Banker Estates—Continuation of Public Hearing Final Subdivision Applicant is seeking approval for the construction, maintenance and use of two family dwellings on Lots 2 and 3. The Property is located on the East side of Banker Street, 0 Feet South of Old Nyack Turnpike.
Tax Designation 57.17-2-11, Zone R-15.

Amy Mele, attorney for applicant, 4 Laurel Road New City NY 10956
Rachel Barese, Civil Tec Engineering & Surveying PC, 139 Lafayette Avenue, Suffern, NY 10901

Chairman Rubin made a motion to adjourn the Public Hearing for Banker Estates Final Subdivision to the June 1, 2017 Planning Board Meeting based on the applicant submitting revised documents no later than May 15, 2017. Ms. Barese will submit directly to Mr. Baum, Mr. Rocks & Mr. Stach, with the balance to Ms. Ballek for distribution to the Board. Mr. Luciano seconded the motion. All those in favor, upon vote, the motion carried.

Mr. Levine requested that a letter be sent to the Board if the adjournment date cannot be met.

Banker Estates—Continuation of Public Hearing Preliminary Site Plan Applicant is seeking approval for the construction, maintenance and use of two family dwellings on Lots 2 and 3. The Property is located on the East side of Banker Street, 0 Feet South of Old Nyack Turnpike.

Tax Designation 57.17-2-11, Zone R-15.

Amy Mele, attorney for applicant, 4 Laurel Road New City NY 10956

Rachel Barese, Civil Tec Engineering & Surveying PC, 139 Lafayette Avenue, Suffern, NY 10901

Chairman Rubin opened the meeting to the public.

Chairman Rubin asked if anyone else wished to speak. No one did.

Chairman Rubin made a motion to adjourn the Public Hearing for Banker Estates Preliminary Site Plan to the June 1, 2017 Planning Board Meeting based on the applicant submitting revised documents no later than May 15, 2017. Ms. Barese will submit directly to Mr. Baum, Mr. Rocks & Mr. Stach, with the balance to Ms. Ballek for distribution to the Board. Mr. Luciano seconded the motion. All those in favor, upon vote, the motion carried.

Mr. Levine requested that a letter be sent to the Board if the adjournment date cannot be met.

Congregation Yesodey Hatalmud (2 Chelsea Lane)—Preliminary Site Plan (Informal Discussion)

Applicant is seeking approval for the to develop property for use as a rabbi's residence. The property is currently a single-family residence. There is also a driveway and parking lot proposed.

Tax Designation 56.20-1-38, Zone 25.

Amy Mele, attorney for applicant, 4 Laurel Road New City NY 10956

Rachel Barese, Civil Tec Engineering & Surveying PC, 139 Lafayette Avenue, Suffern, NY 10901

Ms. Mele spoke briefly about 2 concept plans that were submitted for review; 1 plan encroached a little more into the Wetlands than the other plans.

Discussion on the on-site visit the Board took on April 30, 2017 and how the Wetland delineation that had been set fourth previously may need to be redefined. Mr. Torgersen, the Landscape Architect will revisit area and reflag.

Mr. Luciano spoke about Wetland growth in the parking area. Chairman Rubin stated that if there is any additional plant growth the plans should be revised and a report should be written. Ms. Barese agreed and said she'd also include a narrative.

Mr. Luciano thanked the applicant for the 2nd on-site visit, stating that these issues were discovered on the 2nd visit.

Mr. Wasserman made a motion to adjourn the meeting, Mr. Luciano seconded he motion. All those in favor, upon vote, the motion carried.

